



City of McMinnville
Planning Department
231 NE Fifth Street
McMinnville, OR 97128
(503) 434-7311

www.mcminnvilleoregon.gov

EXHIBIT 1 - MINUTES

September 26, 2018
Historic Landmarks Committee
Regular Meeting

3:00 pm
Community Development Center
McMinnville, Oregon

Members Present: Chair Joan Drabkin, Mary Beth Branch, Mark Cooley, John Mead and Heather Sharfeddin

Members Absent:

Staff Present: Chuck Darnell – Senior Planner

Others Present: Terry Hall

1. Call to Order

Chair Drabkin called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m.

2. Citizen Comments

Terry Hall, Square Deal Construction Company, discussed a project that was underway on Lincoln Street and how in the process of getting a permit he found out he needed to talk to the HLC as well. He explained the railing they were planning to use which was made of composite material. He thought it looked close to the original.

Senior Planner Darnell discussed and showed pictures of the house on Lincoln and how the Historic Resources Inventory from the 1980s listed the property as a B level.

It was clarified that the project would only be the rail, replacing and adding it in some areas and raising the handrail height to 36 inches. The color would be close to the original.

Senior Planner Darnell explained the approval criteria for alterations to a historic landmark and reviewed the definition of alteration. He thought the design fit with the building, but he questioned the material. Because this item had not been included in the public notice, a decision could not be made today. He asked if the HLC thought what was being proposed met the definition of alteration.

There was discussion regarding whether or not this would set a precedent and the proposed material.

Committee Member Branch was not concerned about the railing itself, but was concerned about the material proposed.

Committee Member Sharfeddin asked if the property owners had considered using materials that would have been original to the house. Mr. Hall said he had given them a bid using wood and the property owners had come up with the alternative material on their own.

Chair Drabkin thought the question of precedent was the most important part of this discussion. This material did not look like wood.

Committee Member Mead thought if they allowed a non-wood product on hand railings, people would take that further and use other materials and not get approval from the HLC. He clarified the survey from the 1980s said the railing was missing except for the east side sections.

Committee Member Cooley said an alteration was a design or material change and it should go through an approval process.

There was consensus that the replacement of the porch deck boards with the composite material could be treated as general repairs and not treated as an alteration, as the porch deck boards were similar in color, were existing prior to the construction activities, and were not as visible so would not result in a change in appearance, as stated in the definition of "alteration" in Section 17.06.060 of the McMinnville City Code. However, the Committee had concerns with the railing as a visible and prominent feature on the structure, and a Certificate of Approval application would need to be submitted.

Committee Member Branch said it would be hard for her to approve the use of the proposed material for the rails due to the historic level of the property and the fact that this was a covered porch with some weather protection.

Mr. Hall explained how wood railings were hard to maintain and expensive.

It was suggested that Mr. Hall bring in a sample of the material that was painted the same sheen that the rest of the trim would be as part of the application.

3. Approval of Minutes

- A. April 5, 2018 Meeting Minutes
- B. April 25, 2018 Meeting Minutes

Committee Member Branch moved to approve the April 5 and April 25, 2018 meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Committee Member Mead and passed 5-0.

4. Action Items

A. Recommendation on Historic Preservation Plan

Senior Planner Darnell reviewed the final draft of the Historic Preservation Plan. The bulk of the plan had not changed since the last draft that was presented to the HLC. He gave an overview of the chapters and the survey and inventory area recommendations. The plan was meant to be a guiding document for the City and identified projects to work on. Staff recommended the HLC recommend approval of the plan to the Planning Commission and City Council.

Committee Member Cooley commented that the history portion of the plan was euro-centric and did not include the perspectives of other cultures.

Senior Planner Darnell thought the original intent was to document architectural forms. He suggested adding an action item for Goal 1, Policy 1b, to expand the historic context chapter to include other cultures and pre-settlement history.

There was discussion regarding what to include in the chapter including incorporating cultural contributions to the development of McMinnville and the uses of buildings in the City.

There was consensus to have staff refine the wording and bring it back to the next meeting.

5. Discussion Items

A. Update on Final CLG Grant Activities

Senior Planner Darnell provided an update on the final CLG grant activities that were completed in July and August of 2018. These included the Historic Preservation Plan, intensive level survey, and historic preservation awards. There were funds left over that were going to be used for a walking tour brochure, but that had not been done. Staff used the funds to reprint the Stroll McMinnville booklet and ordered more frames for the preservation awards. The next application submittal would be in February 2019.

6. Old/New Business

None

7. Committee/Commissioner Comments

None

8. Staff Comments

Senior Planner Darnell announced the State Historic Preservation Office's annual training on November 16.

9. Adjournment

Chair Drabkin adjourned the meeting at 4:15 p.m.