



City of McMinnville
Planning Department
231 NE Fifth Street
McMinnville, OR 97128
(503) 434-7311
www.mcminnvilleoregon.gov

EXHIBIT 1 - STAFF REPORT

DATE: October 14, 2021
TO: Historic Landmark Committee Members
FROM: Amy Dixon, Contract Planner
SUBJECT: AMENDED DDR 1-21 (Downtown Design Review) – 631 NE 1st Street

STRATEGIC PRIORITY & GOAL:



GROWTH & DEVELOPMENT CHARACTER

Guide growth & development strategically, responsibly & responsibly to enhance our unique character.

OBJECTIVE/S: Strategically plan for short and long-term growth and development that will create enduring value for the community

Report in Brief:

This is a quasi-judicial review of an amendment to a Downtown Design Review land-use application to address a change to the approved exterior building material from traditional stucco to painted cementitious panels with reveal joints for a proposed new building on the property at 631 NE 1st Street (Tax Lot 11300, Section 21BC, T. 4 S., R. 4 W., W.M), and to approve selected exterior building colors.

New construction in McMinnville's Downtown Overlay District is subject to the downtown design review standards of Chapter 17.59 of the McMinnville Municipal Code (MMC). The process and criteria for review is described in Section 17.59.030(C) of the MMC. Per the MMC, the McMinnville Historic Landmarks Committee (MHLC) serves as the decision-making body for the design review of all new construction.

Background:

The applicants, Amy & Silas Halloran-Steiner, received approval on June 24, 2021 for a new building at 631 NE 1st Street, per Docket DDR 1-21.

As part of the DDR-1-21 Certificate of Approval decision, a number of conditions of approval were deemed necessary. One of those conditions of approval was that the applicant provide samples or examples of the exterior building colors to the Committee for review and approval prior to application on the building. This application includes those samples for review and approval.

Additionally, due to escalating construction costs, the applicant is requesting consideration of an exterior material change from traditional stucco to painted cementitious panels with reveal joints.

The subject property is located at 631 NE 1st Street. The property is identified as Tax Lot 11300, Section 21BC, T. 4 S., R. 4 W., W.M. **See Vicinity Map (Figure 1) below.**

Figure 1. Vicinity Map (Property Lines Approximate)



The property is currently vacant. A historic resource (resource number D878) previously existed on the property, but was approved to be demolished as reviewed under docket number HL 1-18. The historic resource was demolished in 2018. A proposal for a new building was reviewed and approved in 2018 as well, which was approved under docket number DDR 7-18. However, the construction of the previously proposed building never moved forward. The property has since changed ownership, and the current owners have been approved for a different new building on the subject property, under docket number DDR 1-21.

Discussion:

Decisions and/or recommendations for approval of the land use application is dependent upon whether or not the application meets state regulations, the McMinnville Comprehensive Plan and the McMinnville Municipal Code. The application can either meet these criteria as proposed, or a condition of approval can be provided that either outlines what needs to occur to meet the criteria or when something needs to occur to meet the criteria.

The specific review criteria for Downtown Design Review for New Construction in Section 17.59.040 of the MMC require the proposal to be consistent with the applicable Downtown Design Standards and Guidelines in Chapter 17.59 of the MMC, as well as the following review criteria:

1. The City’s historic preservation policies set forth in the Comprehensive Plan;
2. If a structure is designated as a historic landmark on the City’s Historic Resources Inventory or is listed on the National Register for Historic Places, the City’s historic preservation regulations in Chapter 17.65, and in particular, the standards and guidelines contained in Section 17.65.060(2);

Attachments:

Attachment A: Decision, Conditions, Findings of Fact and Conclusionary Findings for the Approval of Amended DDR 1-21

Attachment B: Amended DDR 1-21 Application Materials

In addition, any request for a waiver from a Downtown Design Standard is subject to the specific review criteria in Section 17.59.040(A)(3) of the MMC as follows:

- a. There is a demonstrable difficulty in meeting the specific requirements of this Chapter due to a unique or unusual aspect of the site, an existing structure, or proposed use of the site;
- b. There is demonstrable evidence that the alternative design accomplishes the purpose of this Chapter in a manner that is equal or superior to a project designed consistent with the standards contained herein; and
- c. The waiver requested is the minimum necessary to alleviate the difficulty of meeting the requirements of this Chapter.

Summary of Applicant Findings

The applicant has provided a written narrative and findings to support their requests to change the approved exterior building material. The narrative and findings are provided in the application materials, and are also reiterated and expanded upon in the Decision Document. The Decision Document includes the specific findings of fact for each of the applicable review criteria, but an overview of the findings in those Decision Documents is provided below.

Analysis of Review Criteria/Design Standards – Change in Exterior Materials

The building was approved under docket number DDR 1-21 with smooth stucco, which is an allowable exterior building material. The applicants are proposing to change from smooth stucco to painted cementitious panels with reveal joints.

Cementitious panels are not listed in Section 17.59.050 as prohibited building materials within the Downtown Design Overlay District. (See code below).

Section 17.59.050(C)(2)

The following materials are prohibited for use on visible surfaces (not applicable to residential structure):

- a. *Wood, vinyl, or aluminum siding;*
- b. *Wood, asphalt, or fiberglass shingles;*
- c. *Structural ribbed metal panels;*
- d. *Corrugated metal panels;*
- e. *Plywood sheathing, to include wood paneling such as T-111;*
- f. *Plastic sheathing; and*
- g. *Reflective or moderate to high grade tinted glass.*

However, they are not listed specifically as approved materials either, since they are not found on registered historic buildings in the downtown area. (See code below).

Section 17.59.050(C)(1)

Exterior building materials shall consist of building materials found on registered historic buildings in the downtown area including block, brick, painted wood, smooth stucco, or natural stone.

The applicant notes that recent projects have been approved by the HLC with a similar design material, However, HLC has only approved this material on non-public facing facades on historic buildings.

Attachments:

Attachment A: Decision, Conditions, Findings of Fact and Conclusionary Findings for the Approval of Amended DDR 1-21

Attachment B: Amended DDR 1-21 Application Materials

Therefore, staff is recommending that to satisfy Section 17.59.050(C)(1), a condition of approval is necessary to ensure that the proposed cementitious panels are only installed on non-public facing facades.

Analysis of Review Criteria/Design Standards – Exterior Building Colors

The applicant was asked to bring their color samples to the HLC for final approval once they had chosen them. The code requires low reflective, subtle, neutral or earth tone colors. (See code below).

Section 17.59.050(C)(3)

Exterior building colors shall be of low reflective, subtle, neutral or earth tone color. The use of high intensity colors such as black, neon, metallic or florescent colors for the façade of the building are prohibited except as may be approved for building trim.

The applicant is proposing Rock Candy, a low reflective light grey, for the building panels with Gibraltar, a blueish grey trim band, and Caviar, a bronze, trim along the parapet and windows. The applicant provided colors and renderings that identify exterior colors. The colors shown in the rendering consist of shades of grey, which are generally all subtle, neutral, and earth tones, which are the requirement in Section 17.59.050.

Suggested Conditions of Approval

The suggested Condition of Approval to satisfy Section 17.59.050(C)1 would be to limit the installation of the cementitious panels to non-public facing facades.

Commission Options:

- 1) Close the public meeting and **APPROVE** the application, per the decision document provided which includes the findings of fact.
- 2) **CONTINUE** the public meeting to a specific date and time.
- 3) Close the public meeting and **DENY** the application, providing findings of fact for the denial in the motion to deny.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending approval of the application, subject to the following suggested conditions of approval:

1. The painted cementitious panels with reveal joints shall be located only on non-public facing facades. The First Street façade will require a seamless joint between cementitious panels so that the reveal joint is minimized in visual appearance and prominence on the building façade.

MOTION FOR AMENDED DDR 1-21:

BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT, THE CONCLUSIONARY FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL, AND THE MATERIALS SUBMITTED BY THE APPLICANT, THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMITTEE APPROVES AMENDED DDR 1-21, SUBJECT TO THE CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL PROVIDED IN THE DECISION DOCUMENT.

Attachments:

Attachment A: Decision, Conditions, Findings of Fact and Conclusionary Findings for the Approval of Amended DDR 1-21

Attachment B: Amended DDR 1-21 Application Materials